Thames Tideway Tunnel

Thames Water Utilities Limited

Application for Development Consent

Thames Water

Application Reference Number: WWO10001

Examining Authority's Second Written Round of Questions and Requests for Information

Response from Thames Water

Additional SoCG request - Thames Tideway Tunnel, Cory Environmental and PLA

Doc Ref: APP64.2



Folder **159** January 2014

DCO-DT-APP-ZZZZZ-640200

1 **Question: 40.2**

Can the Applicant, Cory Environmental and PLA provide a SoCG relating to navigational safety at Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore?

1.1 Our response

- 1.1.1 Please see the Statement of Common Ground (SoCG) below.
- 1.1.2 We issued a draft of the SoCG to the Port of London Authority (PLA) and Cory Environmental Holding Limited ('Cory') on 2 January 2014 and received comments from both parties on 7 January 2014. The following version incorporates initial and further review comments. It was sent to both parties on 9 January 2014. It has been agreed by Cory but, at the time of publishing, had not been finally accepted by the PLA.
- 1.1.3 We are continuing the process of agreeing a separate SoCG with Cory. It includes details on navigation in general, works at Carnwath Road Riverside, Kirtling Street and Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore. We intend to submit this to the Examining Authority by 13 February 2014.
- 1.1.4 For information, attached to this response is a record of correspondence, meetings and documents issued between us and Cory.

Statement of Common Ground (SoCG) between Thames Water, Cory Environmental Holdings Ltd (Cory) and Port of London Authority, (PLA) – Navigational Safety at Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore Site.

Introduction

- 1. This Statement of Common Ground has been produced at the request of the Examining Authority's second written questions and requests for information issued on 19 December 2013.
 - S40.2. Can the Applicant, Cory Environmental and PLA provide a SoCG relating to navigational safety at Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore?
- 2. Thames Water Utilities Limited (Thames Water) has been liaising and consulting with the Port of London Authority (PLA) during the project development. The PLA have responded formally to the consultations undertaken. A major area has been issues, impacts and mitigations on navigational safety. An overall statement of common ground between the parties continues to be developed and an interim version (addressing matters relating to construction, navigation, environmental assessment and mitigation and property) was submitted to the Examining Authority on 4 November 2013 and is scheduled to be updated and re-submitted on 13 January 2014.
- 3. Thames Water has been liaising and consulting with the Cory Environmental Holdings Limited (Cory), during the project development. Cory has responded formally to the consultations undertaken. Thames Water liaised with Cory regarding the development of the navigational issues of the project. Thames Water and Cory are in the process of preparing a Statement of Common Ground to assist the Examining Authority. This covers general navigation on the river and specific issues at Carnwath Road Riverside, Kirtling Street and Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore site.
- 4. This additional SoCG by Thames Water, Cory and PLA concentrates on the navigational issues at Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore.
- 5. In this document references to Thames Water shall, where necessary, be construed to mean its equivalent delivery body.

River Navigational Safety – Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore

- 6. Cory and Thames Water agree that the PLA is the responsible authority for navigational matters in the tidal River Thames.
- 7. Cory and Thames have read PLA's written representations (SP00122; 2 December, paragraphs 2.7.5 to 2.7.7). These relate to the Cory navigational safety concerns at Blackfriars, which are detailed below.
- 8. Cory and Thames Water accept the PLA's written representation that following the submission by Thames Water of detailed navigational risk assessments it is for the PLA (in consultation with others) to determine any reasonable mitigation measures to maintain navigational safety.
- 9. The PLA is continuing discussions with Thames Water to ensure that all necessary safeguards are incorporated into the protective provisions in

- favour of the PLA to ensure that the PLA retains plan approval for all project tidal works and maintains the right to make navigational safety determinations in respect of Blackfriars.
- 10. Thames Water has agreed to consult Cory in carrying-out the detailed navigational risk assessment and preparation of method statements (in respect of in-river infrastructure relating to the work to be undertaken at Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore and the relocation of Blackfriars Millennium Pier) in advance of submission for approval by the PLA and before commencing construction of the relevant in-river infrastructure.
- 11. Cory (but neither the PLA nor Thames Water) requests, taking into account the concerns highlighted in written representations and statement of common ground that the Examining Authority determines whether the proposed relocation of the pier, the locations of the permanent and temporary structures and the overall impact on the River Thames should be permitted in the first instance prior to any further PLA approval.
- 12. Cory agrees that following determination of the project the PLA is the appropriate body to consider Cory's navigational safety concerns.
- 13. The PLA and Thames Water (but not Cory) agree that:
 - a. the PLA is the appropriate body to consider Cory's navigational safety concerns; and
 - b. without prejudice to any navigational safety concerns that are identified below, a determination from the Examining Authority is not being sought by the PLA or by Thames Water on potential operational safety mitigation at Blackfriars.

Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore Permanent structure: navigational matters

- 14. At Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore, Thames Water are seeking to build a permanent structure in the river to contain the CSO drop shaft and other structures necessary to intercept the Fleet CSO and make a connection to the Low Level No1 sewer.
- 15. As part of these works, it is proposed to permanently relocate Blackfriars Millennium Pier.
- 16. The permanent CSO drop shaft structure extends into the existing authorised channel (as marked on PLA Chart 317 dated September 2010).
- 17. Following phase two consultation, the project reviewed the design and reduced the extent of encroachment by approximately 4 metres. The permanent CSO drop shaft structure on the 'application' drawings extends into the authorised channel by approximately 3.6 metres. Thames Water has amended the design and will reduce the encroachment by a further 2m (approximately) (PLA SP00122; 2 December, paragraph 2.7.1).
- 18. Cory assisted Thames Water's understanding of the navigational issues concerning the ability of tug and barge tows to navigate past the permanent and temporary structures.

- 19. Cory provided GPS vessel tracks from a previous project (November 2011 tracks).
- 20. In September 2012, Cory undertook trials for Thames Water by providing access to fit GPS devices to their barges to record the vessel tracks through Arch 2 with buoys marking the location of the proposed permanent structure and the proposed relocated Blackfriars Millennium Pier. During the trials, tracks were recorded of tugs towing a single rank (or row) of barges and of tugs towing two ranks of barges.
- This data showed that (after removing obviously erroneous tracks, where the GPS signal was lost), of the barges that were tracked through Arch 2, one passed 5.2 metres from the proposed permanent foreshore structure, two at 8.5 metres and all of the remaining at a minimum of 11.2 metres from the proposed structure. These clearances will increase as a result of reduction in the structure.
- 22. The data above was obtained using a buoy to locate the position of the proposed permanent structure. Cory agree that based on the data obtained, the proposed permanent structure to the west of Blackfriars Road Bridge is unlikely to prevent the use of Arch 2 by tug and tow once the works are complete. However, because the distances were measured using a buoy in the river, it is Cory's view that the data may not be accurate, as it is possible that the solid permanent structure may cause changes to the tidal set in the vicinity of the Blackfriars Bridges.
- 23. Thames Water has agreed to work with the PLA and Cory on assessing the existing fluvial modelling undertaken to assess the predicted tidal set.
- 24. Thames Water has agreed to provide to Cory any assessments of the permanent works on the tidal sets and provide such assessments that have or will be submitted to the PLA for approval.
- 25. The final detail of the structure is not finalised at this stage. When the design is completed a detailed risk assessment in respect of Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore will be produced. At this stage, once the PLA has had the opportunity to consider that risk assessment and any proposed mitigation, Thames Water and the PLA will be in a position to confirm any appropriate mitigation measures to maintain navigational safety that may be required.
- 26. Thames Water has agreed to consult with Cory in respect of Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore in advance of submission of final design details to the PLA for approval.

Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore Relocated Pier: navigational matters

- 27. Thames Water has consulted on the position of the relocated pier.
- 28. Following analysis of the Cory tug and tow September 2012 tracks, the pier was moved 3m to the north to increase further the distance to the authorised channel. Whilst Cory accepted that the movement of the pier was an improvement to its original position, they still submit that the clearance distances are not adequate in terms of safety.

- 29. Following further design development and engagement with stakeholders, the project proposed some further minor changes to the arrangement of the Blackfriars Millennium Pier on 15 July 2013. These proposals were subject to a 28-day period of engagement with relevant stakeholders in order to gain feedback. These changes, together with a record of the consultation and Navigational Issues and Preliminary Risk assessment, where submitted to the Planning Inspectorate as revisions to the Order application on 26/09/13. Cory responded to this consultation on 12 August 2013 identifying concerns highlighted in this SoCG which include the drawings of the pier being marked as 'Illustrative' as discussed further below.
- 30. The proposed pier design provides for two mooring positions for Thames Clippers, an upstream and downstream position with an extended length pier. The downstream position is provided in order to enable greater separation between moored Clippers and Cory barges when they are using Arch no. 2.
- 31. Arch 3 is the arch that would be the preferred route for these vessels, but both Arch 2 and Arch 3 are designated as main working arches.
- 32. The distance between a moored Clipper vessel and the authorised channel in the upstream berth would be approximately 9.3 metres and approximately 13.8 metres for the downstream berth. The PLA have stated that this is greater than clearances at Tower Pier. Cory consider that circumstances are different at this location
- The clearances from all of the tracks are included in the report Thames Tideway Tunnel, Technical Advice Note, Proximity of Cory Barges to Millennium Pier, Document number 1000-DES-BLABF-ZZZ-RU-100000-P01]
- 34. The barge trials identified (tracks detailed on plan 110-DA-ENG-BLABF-000945 East) the closest track showed a clearance of 4.2m to a moored widest Clipper vessel on the downstream mooring point, for a Clipper moored on the upstream section of the pier, this distance was 0.5m (when adjusted to take the location of the GPS devise on the barge into account).
- 35. In relation to the tracking it is Cory's view that this potential clearance is not adequate to safely navigate past a moored Clipper (or any other vessel moored at any location on the jetty),
- 36. Thames Water proposes that if required the operational procedure for Blackfriars pier would require Thames Clipper vessels to berth on the downstream end of the pier in the event that Arch 2 is being used by a tug and tow.
- 37. Cory has stated that they do not accept that it would be safe for its tugs and tows to pass a Thames Clipper on the pier at all, even if it were on the downstream end. Cory have stated that they consider it would, in the first instance, require a procedure to be agreed for this circumstance, binding on Thames Clippers and all other users of the pier in the future. Cory believes it would be difficult in practice to enforce such a procedure.

- 38. PLA have indicated that Cory's concern can be mitigated by additional measures such as a vessel activated warning light system similar to existing lights for reporting vessels on bridge spans.
- 39. Cory had concerns that the location of the passenger pier is still only detailed on plans which are marked as 'Illustrative', this means that there is potential for the final location of the pier to be located further into the river channel as long as it is within the Limits of Land to be Acquired or Used (LLAU).
- 40. Cory understands that the detailed design for works in the foreshore at Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore will be submitted to the PLA for approval. This package of works will be supported by, amongst other information, a works-specific navigational risk assessment. In approving this package of works the PLA may attach reasonable conditions to its approval and those may include appropriate mitigation measures to maintain navigational safety.
- 41. Thames Water has agreed that the permanent location of the pier will not be further out towards the navigational channel than shown on drawing 110-DA-NG-BLABF-000945 July 2013, Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore, Stakeholder Engagement, Proposed Vessel Layout Plan, East, unless otherwise reviewed and agreed with Cory.
- 42. Thames Water has agreed (prior to the submission of applications for tidal works to the PLA) to consult with Cory in respect of Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore in advance of submission of final design details to the PLA for approval.
- 43. Thames Water has agreed to consult with Cory on the final design location for the relocated Blackfriars pier and incorporate any relevant comments received by Cory.
- 44. Thames Water has agreed to consult with Cory in carrying the detailed navigational risk assessment and preparation of method statements in respect of the relocation of Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore pier advance of submission for approval by the PLA before commencing construction of the required in-river infrastructure.

Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore Construction Phases: navigational matters

- 45. To facilitate potential unplanned closures of Arch 3, Cory are considering with Thames Water relocating their mooring in advance of the construction works for the project to opposite the site to Georges Stairs Lower or Hop Pole Moorings subject to agreement with the PLA.
- 46. The PLA considers that this relocation would not be needed throughout all the works.

1.2 Additional information

Liaison and meetings with Cory

- 1.2.1 We have been consulting and liaising with Cory regarding our proposals, as set out in the following tables.
- 1.2.2 Cory has submitted representations and correspondence to us at the following stages.

Table 1.1 Representations and correspondence

Date	Stage	Letter reference
7 January 2011	Phase one	Ref: CD/TT/SD
	consultation	Thames Tunnel Consultation – Objection Tideway Walk Site
25 October 2011	Interim	Ref CD/TT/SH/2
	consultation	Interim Consultation on the Kirtling Street Site
10 February 2012	Phase two consultation	Ref: CD/TT/SH/3
		Phase two consultation – Objection (Kirtling Street Construction Site)
10 February 2012	Phase two	Ref: CD/TT/SH/4
	consultation	Phase two consultation – Objection (Blackfriars Embankment Site)
10 February 2012	Phase two	Ref: CD/TT/SH/5
	consultation	Phase two consultation – Comment on Project Projected Barge Movements
4 October 2012	Section 48 publicity	Ref: CD/TT/SH/6
		Pre Submission Consultation under Section 48 – Comment on <i>Book of Plans</i> ,
		Section 13 for the Kirtling Street Site
4 October 2012	Section 48 publicity	Ref: CD/TT/SH/7
		Pre Submission Consultation under Section 48 - Comment on <i>Book of Plans</i> , Section 17 for the Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore Site
24 October 2012	Letter	Ref: CD/TT/SH/8
		Draft Navigation Risk Assessments for Kirtling Street and Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore
28 May 2013	Section 56 representation	Representation No. 1126
12 August 2013	Targeted engagement response	Ref: CD/TT/SH/9
		Feedback on Proposed Minor Amendments to the Application for Development Consent - Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore Site
4 October 2013	Written representation	PINS Reference 10018630
		Document Reference Cory/04
		Summary of Written Representations of Cory

Date	Stage	Letter reference
		Environmental Holdings Limited
4 October 2013	Written representation	PINS Reference 10018630
		Document Reference Cory/02
		Written Representations of Cory Environmental Holdings Limited

1.2.3 We held meetings with Cory as set out in the table below.

Table 1.2 Meetings held

Date	Details
21 January 2011	Meeting Cory, BMT Isis (Thames Water consultant), Cringle Dock
28 March 2011	Meeting Cory, BMT Isis (Thames Water consultant), Charlton
30 September 2011	Visit to Cringle Dock, Cory, Thames Water
24 February 2012	Meeting Cory, Thames Water. BMT Isis (Thames Water Consultant) Isis, Thames Water Leathermarket Office
20 June 2012	Meeting Cory, Thames Water, BMT Isis (Thames Water Consultant), Cory Coldbath Square Office
11 October 2012	Meeting Cory, Thames Water, BMT Isis (Thames Water Consultant), Cory Coldbath Square Office
3 May 2013	Meeting Cory, Thames Water, Thames Water Offices at the Point, Senior Management Review
7 June 2013	Meeting Cory, Thames Water, Cory Coldbath Square Office
9 July 2013	Meeting Cory, Thames Water, Cory Coldbath Square Office
15 August 2013	Meeting Cory, Thames Water, Thames Water Offices at the Point, Senior Management Review
24 October 2013	Meeting Cory. Thames Water, Thames Water Offices at the Point. Statement of Common Ground/Heads of Terms
10 December 2013	Meeting Cory. Thames Water, Cory Coldbath Square Office. Statement of Common Ground/Heads of Terms
13 December 2013	Meeting/Visit to Cringle Dock, Cory, Thames Water. Building settlement and assessments.
8 January 2014	Telephone conference. Response to Examination Authority

1.2.4 We have issued the following documents to Cory for comment:

Table 1.3 Documents issued for comment

Documents	Issued/Received
Foreshore Zones of Working drawings during development	12 October 2012
Navigational Risk Assessments for Carnwath Road Riverside, Kirtling Street and Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore during development	24 October 2012

Documents	Issued/Received
100-TN-CNL-00000-000023-AA Navigational Risk Assessments: Response to Cory Riverside Comments dated 24th October 2012	3 June 2013
100-RG-CNL-BMTIS-000015-AA Project Wide Vessel Assessment	18 June 2013
100-0G-CMN-CORYE-000001 Letter Targeted Consultation at Blackfriars Bridge Foreshore Site	12 July 2013
100-RG-DES-BLABF-000001 Proximity of Cory Barges to Millennium Pier.	21 October 2013

Copyright notice

Copyright © Thames Water Utilities Limited January 2014. All rights reserved.

Any plans, drawings, designs and materials (materials) submitted by Thames Water Utilities Limited (Thames Water) as part of this application for Development Consent to the Planning Inspectorate are protected by copyright. You may only use this material (including making copies of it) in order to (a) inspect those plans, drawings, designs and materials at a more convenient time or place; or (b) to facilitate the exercise of a right to participate in the pre-examination or examination stages of the application which is available under the Planning Act 2008 and related regulations. Use for any other purpose is prohibited and further copies must not be made without the prior written consent of Thames Water.

Thames Water Utilities Limited

Clearwater Court, Vastern Road, Reading RG1 8DB

The Thames Water logo and Thames Tideway Tunnel logo are © Thames Water Utilities Limited. All rights reserved.

