

TR030003 – Tilbury2 DCO Application - Deadline 4 Submission

Network Rail Infrastructure Limited

1 Summary

- 1.1 We act for Network Rail Infrastructure Limited (NR) in relation to this matter.
- 1.2 The Applicant and NR have been in ongoing discussions and held a meeting on 18 May 2018 to seek to resolve outstanding matters.
- 1.3 Following the meeting and further to ongoing discussions between the parties, NR responds to the information requested in the ExA Second Written Questions (**SWQ**) issued on 8 May 2018, as follows.

2 SWQ 2.8.48 - Would the Applicant and other parties state their positions regarding the protective provisions?

- 2.1 We attach a copy of the latest draft Protective Provisions, which show in tracked changes the amendments that NR proposes to the draft Protective Provisions appended to the DCO.
- 2.2 Discussions are ongoing between the Applicant and NR with regards Paragraph 58 of the Protective Provisions and the list of powers that will not be exercised in respect of railway property without the consent of NR.
- 2.3 Regarding Paragraph 65(1) of the Protective Provisions, the Applicant and NR have agreed amendments regarding the timeframe within which the Applicant must notify NR of electromagnetic interference (**EMI**). NR standard Protective Provisions require the Applicant to notify NR of EMI "at any time prior to the commencement of regular revenue earning operations comprised in the authorised development" and the amendment, which has been agreed between the parties, requires notification "prior to the Completion of the authorised development...", with a new definition of "Completion".
- 2.4 NR does not agree the Applicant's proposed wording at Paragraph 69(4), which states that the Applicant will not be liable for any indirect or consequential losses.
- 2.5 NR continues to engage with the Applicant in relation to the points of disagreement relating to the Protective Provisions and will update the ExA at the next deadline.

3 SWQ 2.18.8 – Would the Applicant and NR update the Examination on the status of their discussion on the matters agreed in principle?

- 3.1 The Statement of Common Ground between the Applicant and NR [**REP3-028 - SOCG12 Appendix 8**], submitted for Deadline 1, and the matters agreed in principle contained therein, remain unchanged.
- 3.2 In addition to the discussions referred to above, NR and the Applicant are negotiating an agreement to make further provision for their respective interests (an **Overriding Agreement**)

and in due course will enter into a form of asset protection agreement to govern the construction of those parts of the authorised development that are located on operational railway land.

- 3.3 The Applicant's and NR's technical experts are continuing to discuss a number of aspects of the design of the authorised development that impacts railway property and / or the operation of the railway.

4 Conclusion

- 4.1 Until such time as the Protective Provisions and an Overriding Agreement are agreed and discussions between the Applicant's and NR's technical teams have been concluded, NR's objection to the DCO remains in order to ensure the safety of the operational railway.

Addleshaw Goddard LLP

22 May 2018

PART 6
FOR THE PROTECTION OF RAILWAY INTERESTS

55. The following provisions of this Schedule have effect, unless otherwise agreed in writing between the Company and Network Rail and, in the case of paragraph 69, any other person on whom rights or obligations are conferred by that paragraph.

56. In this Schedule—

“construction” includes execution, placing, alteration and reconstruction and “construct” and “constructed” have corresponding meanings;

“the engineer” means an engineer appointed by Network Rail for the purposes of this Order;

“network licence” means the network licence, as the same is amended from time to time, granted to Network Rail Infrastructure Limited by the Secretary of State in exercise of powers under section 8 of the Railways Act 1993;

“plans” includes sections, designs, design data, software, drawings, specifications, soil reports, calculations, descriptions (including descriptions of methods of construction), staging proposals, programmes and details of the extent, timing and duration of any proposed occupation of railway property;

[“protective works” means any works specified by the engineer under paragraph 59\(4\);](#)

“railway operational procedures” means procedures specified under any access agreement (as defined in the Railways Act 1993) or station lease;

“railway property” means any railway belonging to Network Rail Infrastructure Limited and—

(a) any station, land, works, apparatus and equipment belonging to Network Rail Infrastructure Limited or connected with any such railway; and

(b) any easement or other property interest held or used by Network Rail Infrastructure Limited for the purposes of such railway or works, apparatus or equipment; and

“specified work” means so much of any of the authorised development as is situated upon, across, under, over or within 15 metres of, or may in any way adversely affect, railway property.

57.—(1) Where under this Part of this Schedule Network Rail is required to give its consent or approval in respect of any matter, that consent or approval is subject to the condition that Network Rail complies with any relevant railway operational procedures and any obligations under its network licence or under statute.

(2) In so far as any specified work or the acquisition or use of railway property is or may be subject to railway operational procedures, Network Rail must—

(a) co-operate with the Company with a view to avoiding undue delay and securing conformity as between any plans approved by the engineer and requirements emanating from those procedures; and

(b) use its reasonable endeavours to avoid any conflict arising between the application of those procedures and the proper implementation of the authorised development pursuant to this Order.

58.—(1) The Company must not exercise the powers conferred by articles

- a) 12 (stopping up)
- b) 13 (temporary stopping up)
- c) 14 (access to works)
- d) 17 (level crossings)

- e) 18 (discharge of water);
- f) 20 (authority to survey and investigate the land);
- g) 21 (felling or lopping of trees or shrubs);
- h) 23 (compulsory purchase of land);
- i) 25 (compulsory purchase of rights);
- j) 26 (acquisition of subsoil);
- k) 27 (private rights of way)
- l) 28 (power to override easements and other rights);
- m) 32 (temporary use of land for carrying out the authorised development);
- n) 33 (temporary use of land for maintaining the authorised development);
- o) 34 (statutory undertakers);
- [p\) 41 \(operation and maintenance\)](#)
- [q\) 42 \(appropriation\)](#)

or the powers conferred by section 11(3) of the 1965 Act in respect of any railway property [or which impacts railway property](#) unless the exercise of such powers is with the consent of Network Rail.

(2) The Company must not in the exercise of the powers conferred by this Order prevent pedestrian or vehicular access to any railway property, unless preventing such access is with the consent of Network Rail.

(3) The Company must not exercise the powers conferred by sections 271 or 272 of the 1990 Act, as applied by article 35 (Statutory Undertakers), in relation to any right of access of Network Rail to railway property, but such right of access may be diverted with the consent of Network Rail.

(4) The Company must not under the powers of this Order acquire or use or acquire new rights over any railway property except with the consent of Network Rail.

(5) Where Network Rail is asked to give its consent pursuant to this paragraph, such consent must not be unreasonably withheld but may be given subject to reasonable conditions.

59.—(1) The Company must before commencing construction of any specified work supply to Network Rail proper and sufficient plans of that work for the reasonable approval of the engineer and the specified work must not be commenced except in accordance with such plans as have been approved in writing by the engineer or settled by arbitration under article 59 (arbitration).

(2) The approval of the engineer under sub-paragraph (1) must not be unreasonably withheld, and if by the end of the period of 28 days beginning with the date on which such plans have been supplied to Network Rail the engineer has not intimated disapproval of those plans and the grounds of disapproval the Company may serve upon the engineer written notice requiring the engineer to intimate approval or disapproval within a further period of 28 days beginning with the date upon which the engineer receives written notice from the Company. If by the expiry of the further 28 days the engineer has not intimated approval or disapproval, the engineer is deemed to have approved the plans as submitted.

(3) If by the end of the period of 28 days beginning with the date on which written notice was served upon the engineer under sub-paragraph (2), Network Rail gives notice to the Company that Network Rail desires itself to construct any part of a specified work which in the opinion of the engineer will or may affect the stability of railway property or the safe operation of traffic on the railways of Network Rail then, if the Company desires such part of the specified work to be constructed, Network Rail must construct it without unreasonable delay on behalf of and to the reasonable satisfaction of the Company in accordance with the plans approved or deemed to be approved or settled under this paragraph, and under the supervision (where appropriate and if given) of the Company.

(4) When signifying approval of the plans the engineer may specify any protective works (whether temporary or permanent) which in the engineer's opinion should be carried out before the commencement of the construction of a specified work to ensure the safety or stability of

railway property or the continuation of safe and efficient operation of the railways of Network Rail or the services of operators using the same (including any relocation de-commissioning and removal of works, apparatus and equipment necessitated by a specified work and the comfort and safety of passengers who may be affected by the specified works), and such protective works as may be reasonably necessary for those purposes must be constructed by Network Rail or by the Company, if Network Rail so desires, and such protective works must be carried out at the expense of the Company in either case without unreasonable delay and the Company must not commence the construction of the specified works until the engineer has notified the Company that the protective works have been completed to the engineer's reasonable satisfaction.

60.—(1) Any specified work and any protective works to be constructed by virtue of paragraph 59(4) must, when commenced, be constructed—

- (a) without unreasonable delay in accordance with the plans approved or deemed to have been approved or settled under paragraph 59;
- (b) under the supervision (where appropriate and if given) and to the reasonable satisfaction of the engineer;
- (c) in such manner as to cause as little damage as is possible to railway property; and
- (d) so far as is reasonably practicable, so as not to interfere with or obstruct the free, uninterrupted and safe use of any railway of Network Rail or the traffic thereon and the use by passengers of railway property.

(2) If any damage to railway property or any such interference or obstruction is caused by the carrying out of, or in consequence of the construction of a specified [work or a protective](#) work, the Company must,

notwithstanding any such approval, make good such damage and must pay to Network Rail all reasonable expenses to which Network Rail may be put and compensation for any loss which it may sustain by reason of any such damage, interference or obstruction.

(3) Nothing in this Schedule imposes any liability on the Company with respect to any damage, costs, expenses or loss attributable to the negligence of Network Rail or its servants, contractors or agents or any liability on Network Rail with respect of any damage, costs, expenses or loss attributable to the negligence of the Company or its servants, contractors or agents.

61. The Company must—

- (a) at all times afford reasonable facilities to the engineer for access to a specified work [or a protective work](#) during its construction; and
- (b) supply the engineer with all such information as the engineer may reasonably require with regard to a specified [work or a protective](#) work or the method of constructing it.

62. Network Rail must at all times afford reasonable facilities to the Company and its agents for access to any works carried out by Network Rail under this Schedule during their construction and must supply the Company with such information as the Company may reasonably require with regard to such works or the method of constructing them.

63.—(1) If any permanent or temporary alterations or additions to railway property, are reasonably necessary in consequence of the construction of a specified [work or a protective](#) work, or during a period of

24 months after the completion of that work in order to ensure the safety of railway property or the continued safe operation of the railway of Network Rail, such alterations and additions may be carried out by Network Rail and if Network Rail gives to the Company reasonable notice of its intention to carry out such alterations or additions (which must be specified in the notice), the Company must pay to Network Rail the reasonable cost of those alterations or additions including,

in respect of any such alterations and additions as are to be permanent, a capitalised sum representing the increase of the costs which may be expected to be reasonably incurred by Network Rail in maintaining, working and, when necessary, renewing any such alterations or additions.

(2) If during the construction of a specified work [or a protective work](#) by the Company, Network Rail gives notice to the Company that Network Rail desires itself to construct that part of the specified work [or the protective work](#) which in the opinion of the engineer is endangering the stability of railway property or the safe operation of traffic on the railways of Network Rail then, if the Company decides that part of the specified [work or the protective](#) work is to be constructed, Network Rail must assume construction of that part of the specified work [or the protected work](#) and the Company must, notwithstanding any such approval of a specified [work or a protective](#) work under paragraph 59(3), pay to Network Rail all reasonable expenses to which Network Rail may be put and compensation for any loss which it may suffer by reason of the execution by Network Rail of that specified [work or protective](#) work.

(3) The engineer must, in respect of the capitalised sums referred to in this paragraph and paragraph 64(a) provide such details of the formula by which those sums have been calculated as the Company may reasonably require.

(4) If the cost of maintaining, working or renewing railway property is reduced in consequence of any such alterations or additions a capitalised sum representing such saving must be set off against any sum payable by the Company to Network Rail under this paragraph.

64. The Company must repay to Network Rail all reasonable fees, costs, charges and expenses reasonably incurred by Network Rail—

(a) in constructing any part of a specified work on behalf of the Company as provided by paragraph 59(3) or in constructing any protective works under the provisions of paragraph 59(4) including, in respect of any permanent protective works, a capitalised sum representing the cost of maintaining and renewing those works;

(b) in respect of the approval by the engineer of plans submitted by the Company and the supervision by the engineer of the construction of a specified [work or a protective](#) work;

(c) in respect of the employment or procurement of the services of any inspectors, signallers, watchkeepers and other persons whom it is reasonably necessary to appoint for inspecting, signalling, watching and lighting railway property and for preventing, so far as may be reasonably practicable, interference, obstruction, danger or accident arising from the construction or failure of a specified [work or a protective](#) work;

(d) in respect of any special traffic working resulting from any speed restrictions which may in the opinion of the engineer, require to be imposed by reason or in consequence of the construction or failure of a specified work or [a protective work or](#) from the substitution or diversion of services which may be reasonably necessary for the same reason; and

(e) in respect of any additional temporary lighting of railway property in the vicinity of the specified works [or protective works](#), being lighting made reasonably necessary by reason or in consequence of the construction or failure of a specified [work or a protective](#) work.

65.—(1) In this paragraph—

["Completion" means the completion of the authorised development so that regular revenue operations can be undertaken pursuant to this Order.](#)

“EMI” means, subject to sub-paragraph (2), electromagnetic interference with Network Rail apparatus generated by the operation of the authorised development where such interference is of a level which adversely affects the safe operation of Network Rail’s apparatus; and

“Network Rail’s apparatus” means any lines, circuits, wires, apparatus or equipment (whether or not modified or installed as part of the authorised development) which are owned or used

by Network Rail for the purpose of transmitting or receiving electrical energy or of radio, telegraphic, telephonic, electric, electronic or other like means of signalling or other communications.

(2) This paragraph applies to EMI only to the extent that such EMI is not attributable to any change to Network Rail's apparatus carried out after approval of plans under paragraph 59(1) for the relevant part of the authorised development giving rise to EMI (unless the Company has been given notice in writing before the approval of those plans of the intention to make such change).

(3) Subject to sub-paragraph (5), the Company must in the design and construction of the authorised development take all measures necessary to prevent EMI and must establish with Network Rail (both parties acting reasonably) appropriate arrangements to verify their effectiveness.

(4) In order to facilitate the Company's compliance with sub-paragraph (3)—

(a) the Company must consult with Network Rail as early as reasonably practicable to identify all Network Rail's apparatus which may be at risk of EMI, and thereafter must continue to consult with Network Rail (both before and after formal submission of plans under paragraph 59(1)) in order to identify all potential causes of EMI and the measures required to eliminate them;

(b) Network Rail must make available to the Company all information in the possession of Network Rail reasonably requested by the Company in respect of Network Rail's apparatus identified pursuant to sub-paragraph (a); and

(c) Network Rail must allow the Company reasonable facilities for the inspection of Network Rail's apparatus identified pursuant to sub-paragraph (a).

(5) In any case where it is established that EMI can only reasonably be prevented by modifications to Network Rail's apparatus, Network Rail must not withhold its consent unreasonably to modifications of Network Rail's apparatus, but the means of prevention and the method of their execution must be selected at the reasonable discretion of Network Rail, and in relation to such modifications paragraph 59(1) has effect subject to the sub-paragraph.

(6) If at any time prior to the ~~completion~~[Completion](#) of the authorised development and notwithstanding any measures adopted pursuant to sub-paragraph (3), the testing or commissioning of the authorised development causes EMI then the Company must immediately upon receipt of notification by Network Rail of such EMI either in writing or communicated orally (such oral communication to be confirmed in writing as soon as reasonably practicable after it has been issued) forthwith cease to use (or procure the cessation of use of) the Company's apparatus causing such EMI until all measures necessary have been taken to remedy such EMI by way of modification to the source of such EMI or (in the circumstances, and subject to the consent, specified in sub-paragraph (5)) to Network Rail's apparatus.

(7) In the event of EMI having occurred –

(a) the Company must afford reasonable facilities to Network Rail for access to the Company's apparatus in the investigation of such EMI;

(b) Network Rail must afford reasonable facilities to the Company for access to Network Rail's apparatus in the investigation of such EMI; and

(c) Network Rail must make available to the Company any additional material information in its possession reasonably requested by the Company in respect of Network Rail's apparatus or such EMI.

(8) Where Network Rail approves modifications to Network Rail's apparatus pursuant to subparagraphs (5) or (6)—

(a) Network Rail must allow the Company reasonable facilities for the inspection of the relevant part of Network Rail's apparatus;

(b) any modifications to Network Rail's apparatus approved pursuant to those subparagraphs must be carried out and completed by the Company in accordance with

paragraph 60.

(9) To the extent that it would not otherwise do so, the indemnity in paragraph 69(1) applies to the costs and expenses reasonably incurred or losses suffered by Network Rail through the implementation of the provisions of this paragraph (including costs incurred in connection with the consideration of proposals, approval of plans, supervision and inspection of works and facilitating access to Network Rail's apparatus) or in consequence of any EMI to which subparagraph (6) applies.

(10) For the purpose of paragraph 64(a) any modifications to Network Rail's apparatus under this paragraph are deemed to be protective works referred to in that paragraph.

(11) In relation to any dispute arising under this paragraph the reference in article 59 (arbitration) to the Institution of Civil Engineers is to be read as a reference to an arbitrator being a member of the Institution of Engineering and Technology.

66. If at any time after the completion of a specified work [or a protective work](#), not being a work vested in Network Rail, Network Rail gives notice to the Company informing it that the state of maintenance of any part of the specified work [or the protective work](#) appears to be such as adversely affects the operation of railway property, the Company must, on receipt of such notice, take such steps as may be reasonably necessary to put that specified work [or that protective work](#) in such state of maintenance as not adversely to affect railway property.

67. The Company must not provide any illumination or illuminated sign or signal on or in connection with a specified work [or a protective work](#) in the vicinity of any railway belonging to Network Rail unless the Company has first consulted Network Rail and it must comply with Network Rail's reasonable requirements for preventing confusion between such illumination or illuminated sign or signal and any railway signal or other light used for controlling, directing or securing the safety of traffic on the railway.

68. Any additional expenses which Network Rail may reasonably incur in altering, reconstructing or maintaining railway property under any powers existing at the making of this Order by reason of the existence of a specified work [or a protective work](#) must, provided that 56 days' previous notice of the commencement of such alteration, reconstruction or maintenance has been given to the Company, be repaid by the Company to Network Rail.

69.—(1) The Company must pay to Network Rail all reasonable costs, charges, damages and expenses not otherwise provided for in this Schedule which may be occasioned to or reasonably incurred by Network Rail—

(a) by reason of the construction or maintenance of a specified work [or a protective work](#) or the failure thereof or

(b) by reason of any act or omission of the Company or of any person in its employ or of its contractors or others whilst engaged upon a specified [work or a protective](#) work;

and the Company must indemnify and keep indemnified Network Rail from and against all claims and demands arising out of or in connection with a specified work [or a protective work](#) or any such failure, act or

omission: and the fact that any act or thing may have been done by Network Rail on behalf of the Company or in accordance with plans approved by the engineer or in accordance with any requirement of the engineer or under the engineer's supervision does not (if it was done without negligence on the part of Network Rail or of any person in its employ or of its contractors or agents) excuse the Company from any liability under the provisions of this sub-paragraph.

(2) Network Rail must give the Company reasonable notice of any such claim or demand and no settlement or compromise of such a claim or demand is to be made without the prior consent of

the Company.

(3) The sums payable by the Company under sub-paragraph (1) may include a sum equivalent to the relevant costs.

~~(4) In no circumstances is the Company liable to Network Rail under sub-paragraph (1) for any indirect or consequential loss or loss of profits, except that the sums payable by the Company under that sub-paragraph include a sum equivalent to the relevant costs in circumstances where—~~

~~(a) Network Rail is liable to make payment of the relevant costs pursuant to the terms of an agreement between Network Rail and a train operator; and~~

~~(b) the existence of that agreement and the extent of Network Rail's liability to make payment of the relevant costs pursuant to its terms has previously been disclosed in writing to the Company,~~

~~but not otherwise.~~(5) Subject to the terms of any agreement between Network Rail and a train operator regarding

the timing or method of payment of the relevant costs in respect of that train operator, Network Rail must promptly pay to each train operator the amount of any sums which Network Rail receives under sub-paragraph (3) which relates to the relevant costs of that train operator.

(6) The obligation under sub-paragraph (3) to pay Network Rail the relevant costs is, in the event of default, be enforceable directly by any train operator concerned to the extent that such sums would be payable to that operator pursuant to sub paragraph (4).

(7) In this paragraph—

“the relevant costs” means the costs, direct losses and expenses (including loss of revenue) reasonably incurred by each train operator as a consequence of any restriction of the use of Network Rail's railway network as a result of the construction, maintenance or failure of a specified work or a protective work or any such act or omission as mentioned in sub-paragraph (1); and “train operator” means any person who is authorised to act as the operator of a train by a licence under section 8 of the Railways Act 1993.

70. Network Rail must, on receipt of a request from the Company, at a frequency to be agreed between the parties, provide the Company free of charge with written estimates of the costs, charges, expenses, future costs forecasts and other liabilities for which the Company is or will become liable under this Schedule (including the amount of the relevant costs mentioned in paragraph 69) and with such information as may reasonably enable the Company to assess the reasonableness of any such estimate or claim made or to be made pursuant to this Schedule (including any claim relating to those relevant costs).

71. In the assessment of any sums payable to Network Rail under this Schedule there must not be taken into account any increase in the sums claimed that is attributable to any action taken by or any agreement entered into by Network Rail if that action or agreement was not reasonably necessary and was taken or entered into with a view to obtaining the payment of those sums by the Company under this Schedule or increasing the sums so payable.

72. The Company and Network Rail may, subject in the case of Network Rail to compliance with the terms of its network licence, enter into, and carry into effect, agreements for the transfer to the Company of—

(a) any railway property shown on the works plans or land, special category land and crown land plans and described in the book of reference;

(b) any lands, works or other property held in connection with any such railway property; and
(c) any rights and obligations (whether or not statutory) of Network Rail relating to any railway property or any lands, works or other property referred to in this paragraph.

73. Nothing in this Order, or in any enactment incorporated with or applied by this Order, prejudices or affects the operation of Part I of the Railways Act 1993.

74. The Company must give written notice to Network Rail if any application is proposed to be made by the Company for the Secretary of State's consent, under article 50 (consent to transfer benefit of Order) of this Order and any such notice must be given no later than 28 days before any such application is made and must describe or give (as appropriate)—

(a) the nature of the application to be made;

(b) the extent of the geographical area to which the application relates; and

(c) the name and address of the person acting for the Secretary of State to whom the application is to be made.

75. The Company must no later than 28 days from the date that the documents submitted to and certified by the Secretary of State in accordance with article 57 (certification of documents) are certified by the Secretary of State, provide a set of those documents to Network Rail in the form of a computer disc with read only memory.

Document comparison by Workshare 9 on 21 May 2018 13:59:34

Input:	
Document 1 ID	interwovenSite://AG/Live/19772478/1
Description	#19772478v1<Live> - Tilbury Draft DCO Protective Provisions - Tilbury Draft
Document 2 ID	C:\NRPortb\Live\JOHNMD\20332550_4.docx
Description	C:\NRPortb\Live\JOHNMD\20332550_4.docx
Rendering set	Standard

Legend:	
<u>Insertion</u>	
Deletion	
Moved from	
<u>Moved to</u>	
Style change	
Format change	
Moved deletion	
Inserted cell	
Deleted cell	
Moved cell	
Split/Merged cell	
Padding cell	

Statistics:	
	Count
Insertions	37
Deletions	13
Moved from	0
Moved to	0
Style change	0
Format changed	0
Total changes	50